

SIGNED.



Dated: June 20, 2007

James M. Marlara  
JAMES M. MARLAR  
U.S. Bankruptcy Judge

IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

In re: ) Chapter 7  
)  
) No. 4:05-bk-07811-JMM  
)  
10 JEFF P. SCOTT dba AMBER VALLEY ) **MEMORANDUM DECISION RE: TRUSTEE'S**  
11 FARM, ) **MOTION TO ALTER OR AMEND ORDER**  
)  
12 \_\_\_\_\_ Debtor. )

The Trustee takes issue with the recent order which grants to Debtor a \$150,000 cash distribution from the proceeds of the \$375,000 sale (Dkt. #55) of his residential real property. The FED. R. BANKR. P. 9023 motion was timely made, and it incorporates FED. R. CIV. P. 59.

The parties are familiar with the facts and the procedure which has brought us to this stage of the proceedings. To the extent it is helpful, the court hereby incorporates by reference its simultaneous Memorandum Decision regarding Debtor's motion to alter or amend orders, entered this same date.

DISCUSSION

The Trustee seeks to tie the Debtor's claim of homestead to the Debtor's estimate of the exempt property's value as of the date of the petition. He believes the court erred, as a matter of law, in not doing so. The court disagrees.

The Debtor claimed a homestead exemption of an amount of \$150,000. This is consistent with the Arizona homestead law. ARIZ. REV. STAT. § 33-1101, *et seq.* Therefore, it was an entirely proper claim to which the Trustee never objected. See FED. F. BANKR. P. 4003 (objection must be made 30 days

1 after conclusion of § 341 meeting or after any amendment to schedules). Therefore, the entire \$150,000  
2 claim may be allowed, and set aside to the Debtor, in the Trustee's later sale proceedings. *Taylor v.*  
3 *Freeland & Kronz*, 503 U.S. 638 (1992). By not objecting within the prescribed time, the Trustee cannot,  
4 at this late date, under any theory, limit or restrict the Debtor's exemption claim, made in the schedules and  
5 which, unlike the debtor in *Taylor*, was entirely statutorily accurate in the first instance, and unassailable.  
6 The Trustee, long ago, waived the right to object.

7 While the property remains in the estate, as this realty has, the estate is entitled to any post-  
8 petition appreciation. *In re Hyman*, 967 F.2d 1316, 1321 (9th Cir. 1992); *In re Reed*, 940 F.2d 1317, 1323  
9 (9th Cir. 1991); *In re Vu*, 245 B.R. 644, 647-48 (9th Cir. BAP 2000).

10 The Trustee's argument here, that the Debtor is limited to only the amount of an exemption  
11 as of the date of the filing of the petition, and is to be measured by the Debtor's estimate of the property's  
12 value at such time, has no precedent in the Ninth Circuit. In fact, the Ninth Circuit has categorically rejected  
13 such an argument.

14 It noted, in *Hyman*, that if the debtor claimed the maximum amounts allowed by statute, then  
15 that is what he should get. The Circuit gave the trustee (or the estate) all post-petition appreciation, and it  
16 also noted that the trustee, being in control of the asset, also controls the timing of the sale. To deny a  
17 debtor his homestead claim, or to attempt to parse or restrict it, was perceived by the Circuit to be  
18 inconsistent with bankruptcy policy.

19 The Ninth Circuit noted that a homestead statute's intended purpose only works "on the date  
20 of sale," explaining that "the concept of an interest that fluctuates in value makes no sense because all the  
21 relevant events occur on the date of sale." *Id.* at 1321. Circuit Judge Kozinski explained:

22 Yet, we see no basis for treating a sale by a trustee in bankruptcy any  
23 different from a sale by a judgment lienholder . . . .

24 The policies of both federal and state law (as well as the interest in  
25 simplifying bankruptcy estate administration) are best served if the  
26 debtor is guaranteed the full exemption amount on the date of sale,  
regardless of the vicissitudes of the real estate market or timing of the  
sale.

27 *Id.* at 1321.

28



1 COPIES served as indicated below on  
2 the date signed above:

3 Michael M. Neal  
4 110 S. Church Ave., #4298  
5 Tucson, AZ 85701  
6 Email [mmnealpc@qwest.net](mailto:mmnealpc@qwest.net)

7 Walter F. Wood  
8 110 S Church Ave Ste 4398  
9 Tucson, AZ 85701  
10 Email [walterfwood@aol.com](mailto:walterfwood@aol.com)

11 Stanley J. Kartchner  
12 7090 N. Oracle Rd., #178-204  
13 Tucson, AZ 85704  
14 Email [trustee@kartchner.bz](mailto:trustee@kartchner.bz)

15 Charles M. Giles, Esq.  
16 Charles M. Giles, P.C.  
17 2720 E. Broadway Blvd.  
18 Tucson, AZ 85716

19 Jane L. Westby, Assistant U.S. Attorney  
20 405 W. Congress, Suite 4800  
21 Tucson, AZ 858701-7300

22 Wilcox Real Estate Company  
23 Earl H. Moser, Agent  
24 916 W. Rex Allen Dr.  
25 Willcox, AZ 85643

26 Office of the U.S Trustee  
27 230 N. First Ave., Suite 204  
28 Phoenix, AZ 85003

By           /s/ M. B. Thompson            
Judicial Assistant

SIGNED